

Diesel Fuel Comparison Study Workshop

August 14, 2008

California Environmental Protection Agency



Air Resources Board

Agenda

Background

- AB679 (Calderon)
- Legislative Intent
- Project Schedule
- Draft Test Plan Review
 - Objective & Scope
 - Proposed Test Engine/Cycle Selection
 - Proposed Test Vehicle/Cycle Selection
- Diesel Fuel Properties
 - CARB ULSD
 - Federal ULSD
 - EPA Unified Model Results
- Future Discussion Topics
- Next Meeting

Background

- Assembly Bill 679 (Calderon)
 - Requires ARB to convene a panel of interested parties to develop a test protocol
 - Test program shall measure the emissions benefits of CARB diesel fuel
 - Conduct test program
 - Report the results to the Senate Committee on Environmental Quality, the Senate Committee on Transportation and Housing, and the Assembly Committee on Transportation

- Legislative Intent
 - Federal ultralow diesel may produce emissions benefits closer to those of CARB diesel
 - Thought to be especially significant for HD diesel engines employing new technology (e.g. EGR)
 - Higher cost of CARB diesel is a competitive disadvantage for CA trucking industry
 - Develop and implement test plan to measure differences in NO_x & PM emissions between CARB diesel and Federal ultralow diesel

Project Schedule

- Contract now in place with UCR CE-CERT for emissions testing
- Draft test plan available for review and comment <http://www.arb.ca.gov/fuels/diesel/dieselcomp/dieselcomp.htm>
- Review of fuel properties underway, soliciting comments
- Emissions Testing – Scheduled to begin in late 2008
 - Coordinating schedules with Biodiesel Research Program

Draft Test Plan Review

- *Assessment of the Emissions from the Use of California Air Resources Board Qualified Diesel Fuel in Comparison with Federal Diesel Fuels – Overview*

Dr. Thomas D. Durbin

University of California, Riverside

CE-CERT

Objective & Scope

- Design & implement test program to define the emissions benefits of CARB diesel fuel versus several different Federal diesel fuel blends
 - Proposed scope:
 - Engine dyno – Test 3 engines, multiple test cycles
 - Chassis dyno – 12 to 15 test vehicles, multiple test cycles
 - Fuels – 1 ‘representative’ CARB diesel, 2 Federal diesel ‘blends’
 - Emissions measurements – THC, CO, CO₂, NO_x, NO, PM

Test Engine Selection - Engine Dynamometer Testing

- Test Engine 1 – Selection Confirmed
 - 2006 Cummins ISM 370, 10.8 liter, EGR
 - EFN: 6CEXH0661MAT
- Test Engine 2 – Selection Confirmed
 - 1991 DDC Series 60, 11.1 liter
 - EFN: MDD11.1FZAZ
- Test Engine 3 – Tentative
 - 2007 DDC MBE4000, 12.8 liter
 - EFN: 7DDXH12.8DJA
 - EGR+OC+PTOX

Test Cycle Selection – Engine Dynamometer

- Recommend using two test cycles
 - First Cycle: Heavy Duty Federal Test Procedure (FTP) Transient Cycle
 - Currently used for emission testing of HDD on-road engines
 - Second Cycle: Propose using ‘Translated’ test cycle developed as part of the Biodiesel Research Program
 - Would allow comparison of engine dyno results with chassis dyno testing
 - Engine dyno results could be confirmed by chassis testing of in-use HDD fleet
 - Translated Urban Dynamometer Driving Schedule (UDDS)
 - Alternative Second Cycle: ARB Highway HDDT Cycle

Engine Dynamometer Test Matrix

- All emissions tests performed in triplicate
- Replicate baseline tests
- 24 tests per engine

Fuel Type	FTP Transient Test Cycle	Additional Test Cycle
CARB ULSD	3	3
Federal – A	3	3
Federal – B	3	3
CARB ULSD	3	3

Proposed Test Vehicle Selection - Chassis Dynamometer Testing

- Propose testing a matrix of 12 – 15 vehicles
 - Matrix should be based on CA's in-use HD on-road fleet
 - Should incorporate a range of technologies if possible
 - Final matrix to be determined
- Vehicle acquisition
 - Advertisement
 - Rental / lease
 - Private owners
- Resources available for vehicle recruitment

Test Cycle Selection – Chassis Dynamometer

- Recommend using three test cycles
 - First Cycle: Urban Dynamometer Driving Schedule (UDDS)
 - Standard chassis dyno test cycle for HD vehicles
 - Second Cycle: ‘Translated’ test cycle from Biodiesel Research Study
 - Lightly loaded UDDS, or
 - ARB Highway HDDT Cycle
 - Third Cycle: Central Business District (CBD) bus cycle

Chassis Dynamometer Test Matrix

- 3 - 4 test iterations proposed for all tests
- 9 – 12 tests per vehicle

Fuel Type	UDDS	Test cycle B	Test Cycle C
CARB ULSD	3 - 4	3 - 4	3 - 4
Federal – A	3 - 4	3 - 4	3 - 4
Federal – B	3 - 4	3 - 4	3 - 4

Diesel Fuel Selection

- Propose using three test fuels:
 - Representative or 'Average' CARB ULSD
 - Representative or 'Average' Federal ULSD
 - Federal ULSD with fuel properties that represent the upper/lower boundaries, affecting emissions characteristics

CARB Diesel Fuel Properties

Average Pool Properties¹: Summer 2006²

Property	CARB ULSD
API Gravity	38.5
Rel Density (60/60°F)	0.8324
T50 (°F)	479.3
Aromatics (v/v)	17.6
Cetane Number (additized)	51.3
Cetane Number (clear)	49.1
Sulfur (ppm)	4.4
¹ All data represent volume weighted averages.	
² Summer 2006: Refers to the period from June 1 through September 20, 2006.	

‘Average’ CARB ULSD Properties Proposed Ranges for Test Fuel Selection

Property	Range
API Gravity	38 - 39
T50 (°F)	470 – 490
Aromatics (v/v)	16 - 20
Cetane Number (additized)	50 - 54
Sulfur (ppm)	<8

Federal Diesel Fuel Properties

“Alliance of Automobile Manufacturers” North American Fuel Survey”

Summary Statistics for Selected Properties from the Winter 2007 & Summer 2007 Surveys

Note: Statistics are based on data from 18 U.S. cities, including Los Angeles

#2 Regular Diesel S15	2007 Winter ¹			2007 Summer ²		
	min	avg	max	min	avg	max
Rel Density (60/60°F)	0.8217	0.8461	0.8625	0.8169	0.8463	0.8602
T50 (°F)	442	500	551	452	504	548
Aromatics (v/v)	16.8	28.7	38.9	12.1	27.5	40.0
Cetane Number	41.1	42.8	46.7	40.2	46.9	56.6
Sulfur ³ (ppm)	1	6	12	1	6	17
¹ Samples taken in January 2007 ² Samples taken in July 2007 ³ Using ASTM D5453 on S15 samples only						

Federal Diesel Fuel Properties

Northrop Grumman 2007 Diesel Fuel Oils Survey, April 2008
2-D Low Sulfur On-Highway Fuel, Summer 2007

Property	2007 Summer ¹		
	min	avg	max
Gravity, °API	34.1	35.9	39.0
T50 (°F)	476	496	519
Aromatics (v/v)	17.5	28.9	35.3
Cetane Number	42.0	46.5	54.4
Sulfur (ppm)	3	6	8
¹ Based on 17 samples only			

Comparison of Federal Diesel Fuel Survey Data

Averages Properties of Samples Collected Summer 2007

Properties	“Alliance of Automobile Manufacturers” North American Fuel Survey Averages ¹ , Summer 2007	Northrop Grumman 2007 Diesel Fuel Oils Survey, April 2008 Averages ² , Summer 2007
Gravity, °API	35.7	35.9
T50 (°F)	504	496
Aromatics (v/v)	27.5	28.9
Cetane Number	46.9	46.5
Sulfur (ppm)	6	6
¹ Statistics are based on data from 18 U.S cities, includes 141 samples, 8 from Los Angeles, California ² Statistics are based on data from 17 diesel fuel oils marketed throughout the United States by 4 petroleum refining companies		

‘Average’ Federal ULSD Properties Proposed Ranges for Test Fuel Selection (Federal – A)

Property	Range
API Gravity	35 - 37
T50 (°F)	490 – 510
Aromatics (v/v)	27 - 33
Cetane Number	44 - 46
Sulfur (ppm)	<15

‘Boundary’ Federal ULSD Properties Proposed Ranges for Test Fuel Selection (Federal – B)

Property	Range
API Gravity	33 - 34
T50 (°F)	-
Aromatics (v/v)	35 - 40
Cetane Number	40 - 42
Sulfur (ppm)	<15

Results from EPA's Unified Model

Proposed Average CARB ULSD vs. Proposed Federal - A

EPA's Unified Model Results	Default NOx Represents All Engines (g/bhp-hr)	Group L NOx Represents EGR Engines (g/bhp-hr)	Default PM Represents All Engines (g/bhp-hr)
Federal - A ULSD	4.819	2.551	0.150
AVG CARB ULSD	4.578	2.435	0.140
Emission Change	- 5.0%	- 4.2%	- 6.5%

Results from EPA's Unified Model

Proposed Average CARB ULSD vs. Proposed Federal - B

EPA's Unified Model Results	Default NOx Represents All Engines (g/bhp-hr)	Group L NOx Represents EGR Engines (g/bhp-hr)	Default PM Represents All Engines (g/bhp-hr)
Federal - B ULSD	4.975	2.623	0.161
AVG CARB ULSD	4.578	2.435	0.140
Emission Change	- 8.0%	- 7.2%	- 12.8%

Future Discussion Topics

- Soliciting comments regarding range of fuel properties for study test fuels
- Finalize vehicle/engine matrix for emissions testing
- Finalize the selection of appropriate Test cycle(s)
- Continued schedule coordination with Biodiesel research project

Next Meeting

- Tentatively scheduled for October 2008
- Visit our web site
 - <http://www.arb.ca.gov/fuels/diesel/dieselcomp/dieselcomp.htm>

Contact Information

- Floyd Vergara, Manager
 - (916) 327-5986
 - fvergara@arb.ca.gov
- Dean Bloudoff
 - (916) 322-1521
 - dbloudof@arb.ca.gov